

# Contents

---

|                        |              |
|------------------------|--------------|
| <i>Preface</i>         | <i>xxiii</i> |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | <i>xxv</i>   |

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <b>Introduction</b>   | <b>1</b> |
| What This Course Is About   | 1        |
| Some Preliminary Thoughts Regarding the Social Objectives of Tort Law | 2        |
| Ethical Responsibilities of Lawyers                                   | 3        |
| Measures of Recovery in Tort: The Rules Governing Damages             | 5        |
| Time Limitations on the Bringing of Tort Actions                      | 6        |
| How to Read an Appellate Decision                                     | 7        |

## **chapter 1**

---

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <b>Intentional Torts: Interference with Persons and Property</b> | <b>9</b> |
| A. Intent  | 9        |
| <i>Garratt v. Dailey</i>   | 9        |
| Authors' Dialogue #1   | 16       |
| Hypo 1   | 17       |
| Hypo 2   | 18       |
| Hypo 3   | 18       |
| <i>Ranson v. Kitner</i>  | 19       |
| <i>Talmage v. Smith</i>  | 19       |
| Hypo 4   | 21       |
| Hypo 5   | 22       |
| B. Battery   | 26       |
| <i>Brzoska v. Olson</i>  | 27       |
| Hypo 6   | 31       |
| Hypo 7   | 32       |

**xii** Contents

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Hypo 8   | 32 |
| <i>Fisher v. Carrousel Motor Hotel, Inc.</i>             | 33 |
| C. Assault   | 38 |
| <i>Western Union Telegraph Co. v. Hill</i>               | 39 |
| D. False Imprisonment                                    | 42 |
| <i>Grant v. Stop-N-Go Market of Texas, Inc.</i>          | 43 |
| Authors' Dialogue #2                                     | 46 |
| Authors' Dialogue #3                                     | 48 |
| Hypo 9   | 51 |
| E. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress (IIED)   | 51 |
| <i>Nagata v. Quest Diagnostics Inc.</i>                  | 52 |
| Hypo 10  | 59 |
| Authors' Dialogue #4                                     | 60 |
| F. Trespass to Land                                      | 63 |
| <i>Rogers v. Kent County Board of Road Commissioners</i> | 63 |
| Hypo 11  | 65 |
| G. Trespass to Chattels and Conversion                   | 65 |
| Hypo 12  | 66 |
| Hypo 13  | 66 |
| Hypo 14  | 66 |
| <i>Intel Corp. v. Hamidi</i>                             | 67 |
| Authors' Dialogue #5                                     | 72 |
| Hypo 15  | 75 |
| H. An Umbrella Intentional Tort                          | 76 |
| Hypo 16  | 76 |
| Hypo 17  | 76 |
| I. The Monster Intentional Tort                          | 77 |

## **chapter 2**

---

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <b>Privileges/Defenses</b>                  | 79 |
| A. Consent                                  | 80 |
| <i>O'Brien v. Cunard Steamship Co.</i>      | 80 |
| Hypo 18                                     | 81 |
| Hypo 19                                     | 82 |
| <i>Hackbart v. Cincinnati Bengals, Inc.</i> | 83 |
| Authors' Dialogue #6                        | 88 |
| Hypo 20                                     | 89 |
| <i>Christman v. Davis</i>                   | 90 |
| <i>De May v. Roberts</i>                    | 95 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Hypo 21  | 98  |
| Hypo 22  | 99  |
| <i>Grager v. Schudar</i>                         | 100 |
| <i>Scott v. Bradford</i>                         | 105 |
| Authors' Dialogue #7                             | 110 |
| Hypo 23  | 110 |
| Hypo 24  | 110 |
| Hypo 25  | 111 |
| <i>Rice v. Brakel, M.D.</i>                      | 113 |
| B. Self-Defense                                  | 118 |
| <i>Hattori v. Peairs</i>                         | 118 |
| Authors' Dialogue #8                             | 126 |
| Hypo 26  | 127 |
| Hypo 27  | 127 |
| C. Defense of Others                             | 127 |
| <i>Pages v. Seliman-Tapia</i>                    | 127 |
| D. Defense of Property                           | 131 |
| <i>Katko v. Briney</i>                           | 131 |
| Hypo 28  | 136 |
| E. Recovery of Property                          | 136 |
| F. Necessity                                     | 138 |
| <i>Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co.</i>   | 138 |
| Hypo 29  | 143 |
| G. Legal Authority                               | 144 |
| H. Disciplining Children                         | 145 |
| Hypo 30  | 145 |
| I. An Umbrella Justification Defense             | 147 |
| <i>Sindle v. New York City Transit Authority</i> | 147 |

## chapter **3**

---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Negligence</b>                                     | 151 |
| A. Introduction                                       | 151 |
| B. The General Standard of Care: Negligence Balancing | 154 |
| <i>Lubitz v. Wells</i>                                | 154 |
| <i>United States v. Carroll Towing Co.</i>            | 156 |
| <i>Washington v. Louisiana Power &amp; Light Co.</i>  | 158 |
| Authors' Dialogue #9                                  | 164 |
| Authors' Dialogue #10                                 | 167 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Hypo 31   | 168 |
| Hypo 32   | 168 |
| Authors' Dialogue #11   | 172 |
| C. The Qualities of the Reasonable Person   | 172 |
| 1. What the Reasonable Person Knows   | 174 |
| <i>Brewer v. Murray</i>   | 174 |
| Hypo 33   | 176 |
| Hypo 34   | 176 |
| Hypo 35   | 178 |
| Hypo 36   | 178 |
| 2. How the Reasonable Person Responds to Emergencies  | 178 |
| <i>Cordas v. Peerless Transportation Co.</i>  | 178 |
| Hypo 37   | 182 |
| 3. Does the Reasonable Person Follow Customary Practice?                                    | 183 |
| <i>Trimarco v. Klein</i>  | 183 |
| Authors' Dialogue #12   | 184 |
| Hypo 38   | 188 |
| Authors' Dialogue #13   | 189 |
| 4. The Physical and Mental Attributes of the Reasonable Person                              | 190 |
| <i>Roberts v. State of Louisiana</i>  | 190 |
| 5. To What Standard of Conduct Is a Child Held?   | 196 |
| <i>Stevens v. Veenstra</i>  | 196 |
| Authors' Dialogue #14   | 198 |
| Hypo 39   | 200 |
| 6. The Standard of Care for Professionals   | 200 |
| <i>Helling v. Carey</i>   | 203 |
| Hypo 40   | 207 |
| D. Judicially-Determined Standards of Care  | 207 |
| 1. Courts Utilizing Risk-Utility Balancing to Decide Cases<br>as a Matter of Law            | 207 |
| <i>Timpte Industries Inc. v. Gish</i>   | 209 |
| 2. Courts Utilizing Safety Statutes to Set Specific Standards<br>of Care: Negligence Per Se | 212 |
| <i>Martin v. Herzog</i>   | 214 |
| <i>Reque v. Milwaukee &amp; Suburban Transport Corp.</i>                                    | 217 |
| <i>Stachniewicz v. Mar-Cam Corp.</i>  | 219 |
| <i>Impson v. Structural Metals, Inc.</i>  | 225 |
| Hypo 41   | 228 |
| E. Proof of Negligence: Res Ipsa Loquitur   | 229 |
| <i>Lamprecht v. Schluntz</i>  | 230 |

|                             |     |
|-----------------------------|-----|
| Hypo 42                     | 238 |
| <i>Ybarra v. Spangard</i>   | 238 |
| <i>Sullivan v. Crabtree</i> | 242 |

## chapter 4

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Actual Causation</b>  | 247 |
| A. But-For Causation: Did the Defendant’s Negligent Conduct Cause the Plaintiff’s Harm?            | 247 |
| <i>Perkins v. Texas &amp; New Orleans R.R. Co.</i>   | 247 |
| <i>Reynolds v. Texas &amp; Pacific Ry.</i>   | 251 |
| <i>Williams v. Utica College of Syracuse University</i>  | 251 |
| Hypo 43  | 256 |
| Authors’ Dialogue #15  | 260 |
| B. Special Problems of Proof: Was the Defendant’s Conduct Capable of Causing the Plaintiff’s Harm? | 261 |
| <i>Herskovits v. Group Health Cooperative of Puget Sound</i>                                       | 263 |
| <i>Rider v. Sandoz Pharmaceutical Corp.</i>  | 273 |
| Authors’ Dialogue #16  | 281 |
| C. When Two (or More) Negligent Actors Concurrently (or Successively) Cause the Plaintiff’s Harm   | 282 |
| <i>Hill v. Edmonds</i>   | 282 |
| <i>Herman v. Wesgate</i>   | 284 |
| <i>Kingston v. Chicago &amp; N.W. Ry.</i>  | 288 |
| Authors’ Dialogue #17  | 291 |
| Hypo 44  | 292 |
| D. When One of Several Negligent Actors Clearly Harmed the Plaintiff, but We Can’t Tell Which One  | 292 |
| <i>Summers v. Tice</i>   | 292 |
| Hypo 45  | 295 |
| <i>Sindell v. Abbott Laboratories</i>  | 295 |
| Authors’ Dialogue #18  | 304 |

## chapter 5

---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Proximate Causation</b>                                  | 307 |
| A. Liability Limited to Reasonably Foreseeable Consequences | 308 |
| <i>Marshall v. Nugent</i>                                   | 308 |
| <i>Demers v. Rosa</i>                                       | 313 |
| Authors’ Dialogue #19                                       | 320 |
| <i>McCahill v. New York Transportation Co.</i>              | 321 |
| Hypo 46   | 329 |

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| <b>xvi</b> | Contents  |     |
|            | Hypo 47   | 330 |
|            | Authors' Dialogue #20   | 331 |
| B.         | Superseding Causes  | 331 |
|            | <i>Derdiarian v. Felix Contracting Corp.</i>                  | 331 |
|            | Hypo 48   | 337 |
|            | <i>Watson v. Kentucky &amp; Indiana Bridge &amp; R.R. Co.</i> | 337 |
|            | Authors' Dialogue #21   | 338 |
|            | <i>Fuller v. Preis</i>  | 342 |
|            | <i>Clinkscales v. Nelson Securities, Inc.</i>                 | 347 |
|            | Hypo 49   | 353 |
| C.         | Proximate Cause and Duty — Two Sides of the Same Coin?        | 355 |
|            | <i>Palsgraf v. Long Island R.R.</i>                           | 355 |
|            | Authors' Dialogue #22   | 361 |
|            | <i>Thompson v. Kaczinski</i>                                  | 363 |
|            | <i>Quiroz v. Alcoa, Inc.</i>                                  | 370 |
|            | Authors' Dialogue #23   | 379 |
|            | Authors' Dialogue #24   | 386 |

## chapter 6

---

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
|    | <b>Nonliability for Foreseeable Consequences (Limited Duty Rules)</b>                  | 391 |
| A. | Limitations on the Duty to Rescue  | 391 |
|    | 1. No Duty Where Defendant Did Not Negligently Create the Risk                         | 393 |
|    | <i>Yania v. Bigan</i>  | 393 |
|    | Authors' Dialogue #25  | 396 |
|    | 2. Categorical Exceptions to No-Duty Rule  | 398 |
|    | Hypo 50  | 400 |
|    | Hypo 51  | 400 |
|    | Hypo 52  | 400 |
|    | <i>Baker v. Fenneman &amp; Brown Properties, L.L.C.</i>                                | 401 |
|    | Hypo 53  | 406 |
|    | 3. Open-Ended Standards for Recognizing Affirmative Duties                             | 410 |
|    | Hypo 54  | 413 |
|    | <i>Regents of the University of California v. Superior Court of Los Angeles County</i> | 414 |
|    | Authors' Dialogue #26  | 424 |
| B. | Limitations on Recovery for Pure Economic Loss   | 427 |
|    | <i>State of Louisiana, ex rel. Guste v. M/V Testbank</i>                               | 427 |
|    | Hypo 55  | 436 |
|    | Hypo 56  | 436 |
|    | Hypo 57  | 436 |
|    | Authors' Dialogue #27  | 440 |

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
| C. | Limitations on Recovery for Emotional Distress | 440 |
|    | Hypo 58  | 447 |
|    | Hypo 59  | 450 |
|    | Authors' Dialogue #28                          | 454 |
|    | <i>Mower v. Baird</i>                          | 455 |
| D. | Harm to Unborn Children                        | 465 |
|    | <i>Procanik by Procanik v. Cillo</i>           | 468 |
|    | Authors' Dialogue #29                          | 474 |

## chapter 7

---

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
|    | <b>Owners and Occupiers of Land</b>          | 477 |
| A. | Duties Owed to Entrants on the Land          | 478 |
|    | 1. Duties Owed to Trespassers                | 478 |
|    | 2. Duties Owed to Licensees                  | 479 |
|    | 3. Duties Owed to Invitees                   | 479 |
|    | <i>Carter v. Kinney</i>                      | 480 |
|    | Hypo 60                                      | 484 |
|    | Hypo 61                                      | 484 |
|    | Hypo 62                                      | 485 |
|    | 4. Rejection of the Categories               | 485 |
|    | <i>Rowland v. Christian</i>                  | 485 |
|    | Authors' Dialogue #30                        | 492 |
| B. | Special Rules Limiting Possessors' Liability | 495 |
|    | 1. The Firefighter's Rule                    | 495 |
|    | 2. Recreational-Use Statutes                 | 497 |
| C. | Duties Owed to Those Outside the Premises    | 498 |
| D. | Duties Owed by Lessors                       | 498 |
|    | <i>Sargent v. Ross</i>                       | 499 |
| E. | Premises Liability: Securing Against Crime   | 503 |
|    | <i>Posecai v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.</i>      | 503 |

## chapter 8

---

|    |                                       |     |
|----|---------------------------------------|-----|
|    | <b>Affirmative Defenses</b>           | 513 |
| A. | Defenses Based on Plaintiff's Conduct | 513 |
|    | 1. Contributory Negligence            | 513 |
|    | <i>Butterfield v. Forrester</i>       | 513 |
|    | 2. Comparative Negligence             | 516 |
|    | <i>McIntyre v. Balentine</i>          | 516 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Hypo 63   | 522 |
| <i>Donze v. General Motors, LLC</i>             | 526 |
| 3. Assumption of Risk                           | 532 |
| a. Express Assumption of Risk                   | 533 |
| <i>Stelluti v. Casapenn Enterprises, L.L.C.</i> | 533 |
| Hypo 64   | 543 |
| b. Implied Assumption of Risk                   | 544 |
| <i>Blackburn v. Dorta</i>                       | 545 |
| Hypo 65   | 549 |
| Authors' Dialogue #31                           | 550 |
| <i>Turcotte v. Fell</i>                         | 550 |
| Authors' Dialogue #32                           | 554 |
| Hypo 66   | 556 |
| 4. Avoidable Consequences                       | 557 |
| <i>Novko v. State of New York</i>               | 558 |
| B. Non-Conduct-Based Defenses                   | 562 |
| 1. Immunities                                   | 562 |
| a. Intrafamily Immunities                       | 562 |
| b. Charitable Immunity                          | 564 |
| c. Governmental Immunity                        | 565 |
| <i>Tippett v. United States</i>                 | 566 |
| <i>Riss v. City of New York</i>                 | 572 |
| Hypo 67   | 578 |
| 2. Statutes of Limitations                      | 578 |
| 3. Statutes of Repose                           | 582 |

## chapter 9

---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Joint Tortfeasors</b>  | 585 |
| A. Joint and Several Liability at Common Law                                | 585 |
| Authors' Dialogue #33   | 591 |
| <i>Doe v. Uber Technologies, Inc.</i>                                       | 592 |
| B. Impact of Comparative Fault on Joint and Several Liability               | 598 |
| <i>American Motorcycle Ass'n v. Superior Court of Los Angeles County</i>    | 598 |
| Authors' Dialogue #34   | 606 |
| C. Satisfaction of a Judgment and the Aftermath: Contribution and Indemnity | 609 |
| D. Settlement and Release   | 611 |
| E. Where the Issue of Divisibility of Damages Is Unclear                    | 614 |
| <i>Michie v. Great Lakes Steel Division, National Steel Corp.</i>           | 614 |



**chapter 10**


---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Strict Liability</b>                                  | 621 |
| A. Possession of Animals                                 | 622 |
| <i>Collier v. Zambito</i>                                | 624 |
| Hypo 68  | 628 |
| B. Abnormally Dangerous Activities                       | 629 |
| <i>Fletcher v. Rylands</i>                               | 629 |
| <i>Rylands v. Fletcher</i>                               | 632 |
| <i>Turner v. Big Lake Oil Co.</i>                        | 633 |
| Hypo 69  | 636 |
| Hypo 70  | 636 |
| <i>Indiana Harbor Belt R.R. v. American Cyanamid Co.</i> | 637 |
| Authors' Dialogue #35                                    | 642 |
| <i>Foster v. Preston Mill Co.</i>                        | 648 |

**chapter 11**


---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Products Liability</b>                                       | 651 |
| A. In the Beginning, There Was Privity: The Negligence Action   | 651 |
| B. The Implied Warranty of Merchantability: The Contract Action | 655 |
| C. Strict Tort Liability: Combining Contract and Tort           | 655 |
| D. Who Is a Seller?   | 658 |
| <i>Oberdorf v. Amazon.com, Inc.</i>                             | 659 |
| E. The Hard Work: Defining and Proving Defect                   | 667 |
| 1. Manufacturing Defects  | 668 |
| <i>Welge v. Planters Lifesavers Co.</i>                         | 669 |
| 2. Design Defects   | 672 |
| a. Risk-Utility Balancing: Reasonable Alternative Design        | 672 |
| <i>Prentis v. Yale Manufacturing Co.</i>                        | 673 |
| <i>O'Brien v. Muskin Corp.</i>                                  | 680 |
| b. The Consumer Expectations Test                               | 688 |
| Hypo 71   | 689 |
| c. The Two-Pronged Test for Defect                              | 690 |
| <i>Soule v. General Motors Corp.</i>                            | 690 |
| Authors' Dialogue #36   | 691 |
| <i>Bifolck v. Philip Morris, Inc.</i>                           | 698 |
| 3. Failure to Warn  | 705 |
| <i>Anderson v. Owens-Corning Fiberglas Corp.</i>                | 705 |
| Authors' Dialogue #37   | 711 |
| Hypo 72   | 714 |

**xx** Contents

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| F. Proximate Cause   | 714 |
| <i>Union Pump Co. v. Allbritton</i>                        | 714 |
| G. Comparative Fault                                       | 719 |
| <i>Webb v. Navistar International Transportation Corp.</i> | 719 |
| H. Express Warranty and Misrepresentation                  | 728 |
| <i>Baxter v. Ford Motor Co.</i>                            | 728 |
| Authors' Dialogue #38                                      | 729 |

## **chapter 12**

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Trespass to Land and Nuisance</b>   | 735 |
| A. An Introduction to the Basics   | 735 |
| B. Trespass in Shades of Gray  | 737 |
| <i>Bradley v. American Smelting and Refining Co.</i>                           | 737 |
| C. Private Nuisance  | 743 |
| <i>Hughes v. Emerald Mines Corp.</i>   | 744 |
| <i>Carpenter v. Double R Cattle Co., Inc.</i>                                  | 747 |
| D. Public Nuisance   | 754 |
| Authors' Dialogue #39  | 756 |
| E. The Coase Theorem: Understanding Nuisance Through<br>the Prism of Economics | 758 |
| F. Remedies  | 761 |
| <i>Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co., Inc.</i>                                     | 761 |
| Authors' Dialogue #40  | 766 |

## **chapter 13**

---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Damages</b>  | 769 |
| A. Compensatory Damages                                   | 769 |
| 1. Damages for Personal Injury                            | 770 |
| <i>Anderson v. Sears, Roebuck &amp; Co.</i>               | 770 |
| <i>Richardson v. Chapman</i>                              | 774 |
| <i>McDougald v. Garber</i>                                | 782 |
| <i>Coyne v. Campbell</i>                                  | 791 |
| 2. Measuring Recovery for Harm to Property                | 795 |
| 3. Wrongful Death and Survival                            | 799 |
| <i>Norfolk Shipbuilding &amp; Drydock Corp. v. Garris</i> | 799 |
| B. Punitive Damages                                       | 804 |
| <i>Owens-Illinois, Inc. v. Zenobia</i>                    | 807 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i> | 815 |
| <i>Philip Morris USA v. Williams</i>                          | 826 |

## chapter 14

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Defamation</b>  | 845 |
| A. Introduction  | 845 |
| B. What Is Defamatory?   | 846 |
| <i>Susan B. Anthony List v. Driehaus</i>                         | 846 |
| C. The Form of Communication — Libel and Slander                 | 851 |
| D. Fact or Opinion   | 852 |
| <i>Green v. Cosby</i>  | 852 |
| E. Communicating the Defamation to Others — Publication          | 861 |
| <i>Barnes v. Yahoo!, Inc.</i>                                    | 865 |
| F. Did the Arrow Hit the Target? Of and Concerning the Plaintiff | 874 |
| <i>Three Amigos SJL Restaurant, Inc. v. CBS News Inc.</i>        | 874 |
| G. The Constitution and the Law of Defamation                    | 884 |
| <i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i>                            | 884 |
| <i>Dun &amp; Bradstreet, Inc. v. Greenmoss Builders, Inc.</i>    | 907 |
| <i>Philadelphia Newspapers, Inc. v. Hepps</i>                    | 911 |
| H. Privileges After the Constitutional Takeover                  | 915 |
| Authors' Dialogue #41  | 916 |
| 1. Qualified Privileges at Common Law                            | 917 |
| 2. Absolute Privileges at Common Law                             | 919 |

## chapter 15

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Privacy</b>   | 923 |
| A. Appropriation of the Plaintiff's Name or Likeness for the Defendant's Advantage | 924 |
| <i>Carson v. Here's Johnny Portable Toilets, Inc.</i>                              | 926 |
| <i>Zacchini v. Scripps-Howard Broadcasting Co.</i>                                 | 935 |
| B. Public Disclosure of Embarrassing Private Facts About Plaintiff                 | 938 |
| <i>Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn</i>  | 939 |
| <i>Gawker Media, LLC v. Bollea</i>   | 944 |
| C. Placing the Plaintiff in a False Light  | 950 |
| <i>Time, Inc. v. Hill</i>  | 950 |

**xxii** Contents

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| D. Intrusion Upon the Plaintiff's Solitude     | 955 |
| <i>Tompkins v. Cyr</i>                         | 955 |
| Authors' Dialogue #42                          | 960 |
| <i>Table of Cases</i>                          | 965 |
| <i>Table of Statutes and Other Authorities</i> | 985 |
| <i>Index</i>                                   | 995 |