

CONTENTS

Preface	xxiii
Acknowledgments	xxv
Editorial Notice	xxvii

1

INTRODUCTION	1
A. Taxing and Spending	1
B. Some Data on Taxes and the Distribution of Income	3
1. Income Tax Data	3
2. Distributional Data	7
C. Why Is Tax Law So Complicated?	12
1. A Model of Economic Activity	12
2. How Hard Can It Be?	15
D. Fundamental Tax Terminology and Concepts	18
1. The Tax Base: From Gross Income to Tax Payable	18
2. Deduction, Exemption, Exclusion, and Credit	23
3. Tax Brackets, Progressive Tax Structures, and Effective and Marginal Tax Rates	24
4. Tax Incidence	27
5. Capital Gain and Dividend Income; Ordinary Income; Losses and Expenses	28
6. Tax Accounting	32
7. Recovery of Cost, Depreciation, and Basis	33
8. Realization and Recognition	33
9. Types of Entities	34
10. Inflation	35
E. Conversion and Deferral	36
F. Compliance and Administration	40
1. Self-Assessment, Audits, and Tax Litigation	40
2. Penalties for Noncompliance	41
G. The Sources of Federal Tax Law in a Nutshell	42
H. Walz Tax Return	45

THE WHY AND THE WHAT OF TAXING INCOME		49
A.	Why Tax <i>Income</i> ?	50
1.	The Tax Base and Ability to Pay	50
2.	Alternative Measures to Ability to Pay	51
3.	Efficiency of an Income Tax	54
4.	Allocative and Distributive Effects	56
B.	What Is “Income” Anyway?	57
1.	What <i>Do</i> We Tax?	57
2.	The Limits of Intuition	58
C.	Back to the Ballpark	61
	<i>Commissioner v. Glenshaw Glass Co.</i>	63
	Notes and Questions	65
	<i>Cesarini v. United States</i>	66
	Notes and Questions	68
D.	Paying Another’s Bills	69
	Notes and Questions	69
	Notes and Questions	70
E.	Noncash Benefits	71
1.	Meals and Lodging Provided to Employees	72
	Silicon Valley’s Mouthwatering Tax Break	73
	Notes and Questions	74
	Questions	75
	<i>Benaglia v. Commissioner</i>	75
	Notes and Questions	79
	Statutory Aftermath to <i>Benaglia</i>	80
	<i>United States v. Gotcher</i>	82
	Notes and Questions	84
2.	Other Fringe Benefit Statutes	85
	Section 132 Fringe Benefits	85
	Questions	86
	Further Notes on Fringe Benefits	87
	Questions	90
3.	Health Insurance	91
4.	Another Approach to Valuation	91
	<i>Turner v. Commissioner</i>	92
	Notes and Questions	93
F.	Price Adjustment or Income?	94
	Residents May Have to Pay Taxes on Their Turf Rebate Money	96
G.	Recovery of Capital	97
1.	Sale of Easements	98
	<i>Inaja Land Co. v. Commissioner</i>	98
	Notes and Questions	99
2.	Gains and Losses from Gambling	100
3.	Recovery of Loss	102
	<i>Clark v. Commissioner</i>	102

Current Legal Status of <i>Clark</i>	104
Notes and Questions	105
Hypothetical	106
H. Recoveries for Personal and Business Injuries	107
1. The Basic Rules	107
<i>Murphy v. United States</i>	109
Notes and Questions	117
<i>Perez v. Commissioner</i>	119
2. Deferred Payments and Structured Settlements	124
3. Medical Expenses and Other Recoveries and Benefits	124
I. Illegal Income	125
<i>Gilbert v. Commissioner</i>	125
Notes and Questions	128
J. Gain on the Sale of a Home	130
Notes and Questions	131

3

THE PRIVATE SPHERE AND THE PUBLIC SPHERE **133**

A. Imputed Income	134
1. Imputed Income, Psychic Income, In-Kind Income	134
Questions	138
2. Drawing the Line	139
Revenue Ruling 79-24	139
Questions	140
3. Imputed Income, Implicit Income, Substitute Taxation	140
B. Gifts	142
1. Gift: The Basic Concept	142
Notes and Questions	145
<i>Commissioner v. Duberstein</i>	146
Notes and Questions	152
<i>United States v. Harris</i>	154
Notes	161
2. Gift: Some Applications	162
Questions	165
3. Transfer of Unrealized Gain by Gift While the Donor Is Alive	166
<i>Taft v. Bowers</i>	167
Notes and Questions	169
4. Transfers at Death	171
Questions	173
C. Transfers Incident to Marriage and Divorce	173
1. Introduction	173
2. Property Settlements	174
a. Transfers Incident to a Divorce or Separation Agreement	174
<i>United States v. Davis</i>	174

Notes and Questions	178
Problems	179
b. Antenuptial Settlements (“Prenups”)	180
<i>Farid-Es-Sultaneh v. Commissioner</i>	180
Questions	183
3. Alimony, Child Support, and Property Settlements	183
a. Transfers Pursuant to Agreements Entered into After 2018	183
b. Transfers Pursuant to Agreements Entered into Before 2019	184
4. Child-Support Obligations in Default	185
<i>Diez-Arguelles v. Commissioner</i>	186
Notes and Questions	187

4

WHEN IS IT INCOME?	189
Value of Deferral	191
A. Annual Accounting and Its Consequences	193
1. The Use of Hindsight	193
<i>Burnet v. Sanford & Brooks Co.</i>	193
Notes and Questions	195
Problems	197
2. Capital Expenditures, Depreciation, and Expensing	197
3. Claim of Right	203
Notes and Questions	204
4. The Tax Benefit Rule	205
Notes and Questions	207
B. Cash and Accrual Methods of Accounting for Income	208
1. Introduction to Accounting Methods	208
Questions	211
<i>Ford Motor Co. v. Commissioner</i>	211
Notes and Questions	218
Notes and Questions	219
2. Delay in Receiving Cash	220
<i>Georgia School-Book Depository v. Commissioner</i>	220
Notes and Questions	222
3. Prepaid Income	223
<i>American Automobile Association v. United States</i>	223
Notes and Questions	228
4. Deposits Versus Advance Payments	229
Questions	230
C. The Realization Doctrine: The Root of Many Tax Evils	230
1. Legal Origins of the Realization Doctrine	231
<i>Eisner v. Macomber</i>	232
Notes and Questions	239
Are Stock Dividends Income?	243
Excerpt from <i>Personal Income Taxation</i>	244

2.	Some Implications of the Realization Doctrine in Practice	245
3.	The Decline of Realization as a Constitutional Requirement	246
	<i>Helvering v. Bruun</i>	247
	Notes and Questions	250
4.	The Limits of Realization: Nonrecourse Borrowing in Excess of Basis	252
	<i>Woodsam Associates, Inc. v. Commissioner</i>	253
	Notes and Questions	254
5.	Contemporary Understandings of the Realization Doctrine	255
	<i>Cottage Savings Association v. Commissioner</i>	256
	Notes	263
	Questions	265
	Problems	265
D.	Statutory Nonrecognition Provisions	266
1.	Introduction to Nonrecognition Rules	266
2.	Like-Kind Exchanges	267
a.	The Like-Kind Requirement	269
	PLR 200203033	269
	Notes and Questions	271
b.	Boot and Basis in Like-Kind Exchanges	272
c.	Multiparty Transactions	274
E.	Open Transactions and Installment Sales	276
1.	Open Transaction Doctrine	276
	<i>Burnet v. Logan</i>	276
	Notes and Questions	278
2.	Executory Contract or Completed Sale?	281
	<i>Lucas v. North Texas Lumber</i>	282
	Notes and Questions	282
	<i>Commissioner v. Segall</i>	283
	Notes	284
3.	The Installment Method	285
F.	Constructive Receipt and Related Doctrines	286
1.	Basic Principles	287
	<i>Amend v. Commissioner</i>	287
	Notes	290
	<i>Pulsifer v. Commissioner</i>	291
	Question	293
G.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation	293
1.	Background	293
	<i>Minor v. United States</i>	294
	Notes	298
2.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation: Current Practice Overview	298
	Problem	303
3.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation: Constructive Receipt and §409A	303
4.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation: Stock Options	305

5.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation: Qualified Equity Grants	306
6.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation: Shortcuts	307
	Fundamental Operating Rules	307
	Nonqualified Stock Options	307
7.	Nonqualified Deferred Compensation: Policy	307
H.	Qualified Employee Plans and Incentive Stock Options	309
1.	Qualified Employee Plans	309
	a. Basic Choices and Rules	309
	b. Amount of Tax Benefit	311
	c. Antidiscrimination Rules	312
	d. Individuals	313
	e. Penalty for Early Withdrawal	314
	f. Mandatory Distributions	314
	g. Limitations on Contributions and Benefits	315
2.	Incentive Stock Options	315
	Questions	316

DEBT AND CERTAIN OTHER FINANCIAL INSTRUMENTS

317

A.	Financial Instruments and the Income Tax	317
B.	Loans and Cancellation of Indebtedness Income	318
1.	The Exclusion of Loan Proceeds from Income	318
2.	True Discharge of Indebtedness	320
	<i>United States v. Kirby Lumber Co.</i>	321
	Notes and Questions	321
3.	Relief Provisions	322
	a. Insolvent Debtors	322
	b. Solvent Farmers	323
	c. Adjustment of Purchase Money Debt	323
	d. Student Loan Forgiveness	324
	e. Mortgage Forgiveness	324
4.	Contested or Uncertain Liabilities	324
	<i>Zarin v. Commissioner</i>	325
	Notes	333
C.	Transfers of Property Subject to Debt	334
1.	The Basic Rules	334
2.	Nonrecourse Debt, Part I: <i>Crane</i> and <i>Tufts</i>	337
	<i>Crane v. Commissioner</i>	337
	Notes and Questions	342
	<i>Commissioner v. Tufts</i>	346
	Notes and Questions	352
3.	Nonrecourse Debt, Part II: Property Worth Less at Acquisition Than the Face Amount of the Debt	354
	a. Seller Financing	354
	b. Mid-Stream Acquisition of “Distressed” Property	354

4.	Gift Tax Liability Created by the Transfer	357
	<i>Diedrich v. Commissioner</i>	357
	Notes and Questions	360
D.	Interest Income and Original Issue Discount	361
	1. Compounding and the Economic Accrual of Interest Income	361
	2. When and Why It Matters: Counterparty Effects	363
	3. Mechanics of the OID Rules	364
E.	Interest on State and Local Bonds	368
	1. Basic Concepts	368
	Notes and Questions	369
	2. Limitations on Exempt Status	371
	3. Constitutional Barrier?	372
	4. Tax Arbitrage	372
	5. U.S. Treasury Bonds	374
F.	Certain Other Financial Instruments	375
	1. Life Insurance	375
	2. Annuities	379
G.	Deemed Realizations: Constructive Sales	382
	Joint Committee on Taxation General Explanation	
	of Tax Legislation Enacted in 1997	384
	Questions	385

6

	WHOSE INCOME IS IT?	387
A.	Income from Services: Diversion by Private Agreement	389
	<i>Lucas v. Earl</i>	389
	Notes and Questions	390
B.	Income from Services: Diversion by Operation of Law	391
	<i>Poe v. Seaborn</i>	392
	Notes and Questions	394
C.	The Marriage Penalty (and Bonus)	396
	1. The Legislative “Solution”: The Income-Splitting Joint Return	396
	2. Addressing the Marriage Penalty/Bonus	397
	3. Filing Status: Summary and Data	398
D.	Transfers of Property and Income from Property	399
	<i>Blair v. Commissioner</i>	399
	<i>Helvering v. Horst</i>	401
	Notes and Questions	405
E.	Services Transformed into Property	406
	<i>Helvering v. Eubank</i>	407
	<i>Heim v. Fitzpatrick</i>	408
	Notes and Questions	410
F.	Shifting Income Through Legal Entities	411
	1. Family Partnerships and S Corporations	412
	2. Income Splitting Through Corporations	413

EXPENSES OF EARNING INCOME		415
A.	Introduction	415
1.	Expenses and the Net Income Concept	415
2.	Deduction Mechanics	416
B.	The Pass-Through Deduction for Qualifying Business Income	417
C.	Current Expenses Versus Capital Expenditures	420
1.	Which Expenditures Must Be Capitalized?	420
	<i>Encyclopaedia Britannica v. Commissioner</i>	420
	Notes and Questions	425
2.	The Uniform Capitalization Rules of §263A	427
3.	The <i>INDOPCO</i> Decision and the Capitalization Regulations	428
D.	Repair and Maintenance Expenses	430
	<i>Midland Empire Packing Co. v. Commissioner</i>	430
	Notes and Questions	432
	Treatment of Environmental Remediation Expenses Under Section 263A	435
E.	Inventory Accounting	437
	Problem	438
F.	“Ordinary and Necessary”	438
1.	Payments for “Goodwill” and Other Assets	438
	<i>Welch v. Helvering</i>	438
	Notes and Questions	440
2.	Extraordinary Behavior	442
	<i>Gilliam v. Commissioner</i>	442
	Notes and Questions	447
3.	Reasonable Compensation	449
4.	Sexual Harassment Settlements	450
G.	Depreciation and Amortization	450
1.	Significance of the Timing of Cost Recovery	450
2.	Overview of Depreciation Rules	451
3.	The Current System	454
a.	Tangible Assets Depreciable Under §168	454
	Comparative Focus: The UK “Industrial Buildings Allowance”	456
4.	Goodwill and Other Intangibles	457
H.	Depletion and Intangible Drilling Costs	459
I.	Other Loss Deduction Issues	461
1.	Timing of Loss Allowance	462
2.	Was the Taxpayer Seeking to Earn Income?	465
3.	Determining the Amount of Allowable Loss	466
4.	Section 165 in Action: The Madoff Fraud	466
	Revenue Ruling 2009-9	467
	Notes and Questions	470

J.	Investments in Human Capital	471
1.	Educational Expenses in Theory	471
	Present Law and Analysis Relating to Tax Benefits for Higher Education	472
2.	Defining Deductible Educational Expenses in Practice	473
	<i>Carroll v. Commissioner</i>	474
	Notes and Questions	475
	<i>Kopaigora v. Commissioner</i>	475
	Notes and Questions	478

8

TAX SHELTERS AND TAX PLANNING **481**

A.	The Nature of the Problem	481
B.	The Origin of Substance-over-Form Doctrine	484
	Notes and Questions	486
1.	Gregory v. Helvering on Appeal	486
	Notes and Questions	487
C.	Requiring Economic Substance in Response to Loss-Generating Tax Shelters	488
	<i>Knetsch v. United States</i>	489
	Notes and Questions	492
	The Development of the Economic Substance Doctrine	494
D.	Common-Law and Other Responses to Sale-Leasebacks	495
1.	Two Distinct Tax Reasons for Engaging in Sale-Leasebacks	495
2.	Overvaluation Sale-Leasebacks	497
	<i>Estate of Franklin v. Commissioner</i>	497
	Notes and Questions	501
3.	Sale-Leasebacks That Change the Tax Owner for Depreciation Purposes	502
E.	Tax Shelters More Generally	504
1.	Definition and Elements of a Tax Shelter	504
2.	Real Estate and Other Tax Shelters of the 1970s and Early 1980s	505
3.	The Congressional Response to the Tax Shelters of the 1980s	506
	Notes and Questions	509
4.	More Recent Corporate and Individual Tax Shelters	510
	<i>Winn-Dixie Stores, Inc. v. Commissioner</i>	511
	Notes	513
5.	Codification of Economic Substance	514
6.	Rules Versus Standards	515
7.	Rules Aimed at the Tax Lawyer	517

MIXED BUSINESS AND PERSONAL EXPENSES		519
A.	Clothing Expenses	521
	<i>Pevsner v. Commissioner</i>	522
	Note	524
	Questions	525
B.	Home Offices and Vacation Homes	525
1.	Home Offices	525
	<i>Popov v. Commissioner</i>	526
	Questions	529
2.	Vacation Homes	530
C.	Child-Care Expenses	531
	<i>Smith v. Commissioner</i>	531
	Notes and Questions	532
D.	Commuting Expenses	534
	<i>Commissioner v. Flowers</i>	535
	Notes and Questions	539
	Comparative Focus: A Comparative Perspective: Commuting Expenses Auf Deutschland	540
	<i>Hantzis v. Commissioner</i>	540
	Notes and Questions	546
	Problems: Testing the Rationale	547
E.	Travel and Entertainment Expenses	548
1.	The Deductibility of Business Travel	548
	<i>Rudolph v. United States</i>	550
2.	Limitations Under §274	553
3.	Business Lunches	555
	<i>Moss v. Commissioner</i>	555
	Questions	558
F.	Legal Expenses	559
	<i>United States v. Gilmore</i>	559
	Notes and Questions	563
G.	Hobby Losses	565
	<i>Nickerson v. Commissioner</i>	565
	Notes and Questions	570

PERSONAL DEDUCTIONS, EXEMPTIONS, AND CREDITS		573
A.	Introduction	573
1.	The Basic Structure of Personal Deductions	573
2.	The Rationale for Personal Deductions	574

B. Casualty Losses	575
C. Medical Expenses: Exclusion for Employer-Provided Healthcare and Deduction for Extraordinary Medical Expenses	576
1. Overview and Policy	576
2. What Is “Medical Care”?	577
<i>Taylor v. Commissioner</i>	578
<i>Ochs v. Commissioner</i>	579
Notes and Questions	581
D. Charitable Contributions and Treatment of Nonprofits	582
1. Overview	582
2. Rules Governing Charitable Contributions	583
3. Treatment of Nonprofit Organizations	584
4. Policy	585
Comparative Focus: Canada’s Charitable Contribution Credit	586
5. Gifts with Private Objectives or Benefits	587
<i>Ottawa Silica Co. v. United States</i>	587
Notes and Questions	590
6. More on Private Benefits	591
a. Quid Pro Quo Contributions	591
b. The Complicitous Role of Some Charitable Organizations	592
7. Overvaluation of Contributed Property	592
8. The Special Case of Collegiate Athletics	593
9. Religious Benefits and Services	593
10. Voluntariness	594
11. Public Policy and Charitable Purpose	595
<i>Bob Jones University v. United States</i>	595
Notes and Questions	602
12. Loss of Exemption Due to Private Inurement	603
E. Interest	603
1. The Rules	603
2. Asymmetrical Treatment of Interest Income and Expense	604
3. Policy Justification and Transition Issues	605
4. Tracing	606
5. Interest on Student Loans	606
F. Taxes	606
1. Rationale for the SALT Deduction	607
2. The Basic Structure of U.S. State and Local Taxation	607
G. Personal Exemptions	608
H. The Alternative Minimum Tax	609
1. The Individual Alternative Minimum Tax	609
2. Corporate AMT	610

11

TAX AND POVERTY: THE EARNED INCOME TAX CREDIT 611

A. Introduction	611
B. The Income Tax and the Earned Income Tax Credit	613
1. Features of the Tax Law That Reduce Liability to Zero	613
2. Overview of the EITC	614
3. Operation of the EITC	615
4. Efficiency of the EITC	617
5. Reform Proposals	617

12

CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES 619

A. Background and Statutory Framework	619
1. Net Capital Gain	619
2. Statutory Tax Rates for Net Capital Gain	621
3. Net Capital Loss	622
B. The Definition of “Capital Asset”	622
C. Policy Considerations	624
1. Rationale for Favorable Treatment of Capital Gain	624
2. Rationale for Limiting the Deductibility of Capital Losses	626
Comparative Focus: South Africa’s Decision	
to Tax Capital Gains	627
D. Property Held “Primarily for Sale to Customers”	628
1. Sale to “Customers”	628
<i>Bielfeldt v. Commissioner</i>	628
Notes and Questions	630
2. “Primarily for Sale”	631
<i>Biedenharn Realty Co. v. United States</i>	631
Notes and Questions	638
E. Transactions Related to the Taxpayer’s Business	639
<i>Corn Products Refining Co. v. Commissioner</i>	641
<i>Arkansas Best Corporation v. Commissioner</i>	644
Notes and Questions	647
F. Substitutes for Ordinary Income	648
1. Payment for Cancellation of a Lease	648
<i>Hort v. Commissioner</i>	648
Notes and Questions	650
2. Sale of Interest in a Trust	653
<i>McAllister v. Commissioner</i>	653
Notes and Questions	656
3. Lottery Winnings	657
<i>Womack v. Commissioner</i>	657
Questions	660

4. Oil Payments	661
<i>Commissioner v. P. G. Lake, Inc.</i>	661
Notes and Questions	664
G. Other Claims and Contract Rights	665
1. Termination Payments	665
<i>Baker v. Commissioner</i>	665
Notes and Questions	672
2. Theatrical Production Rights	672
<i>Commissioner v. Ferrer</i>	672
Notes and Questions	680
3. Right of Publicity or Commercial Exploitation	680
<i>Miller v. Commissioner</i>	680
Question	683
4. Patents and Copyrights	683
H. Correlation with Prior Related Transactions	684
<i>Merchants National Bank v. Commissioner</i>	684
<i>Arrowsmith v. Commissioner</i>	685
Notes	687
I. Requirement of a Sale or Exchange	688
Appendix: The Federal Taxing and Spending Powers	691
History	699
Table of Cases	703
Table of Internal Revenue Code Sections	709
Table of Treasury Regulations	715
Table of IRS Revenue Rulings	717
Table of Miscellaneous IRS Pronouncements	719
Index	721